

Comanches, who stem from the northern Shoshones, not uncommonly experienced the return from the spirit world on the part of those who had died. It may be said of the Comanches that they had all the basic cultural materials for the prophet cult, such as Spier describes, except the dance form. And they used the Sun Dance to fill this need.

The crisis situation which Kroeber,¹³ Lowie,¹⁴ Wallis,¹⁵ and Lesser¹⁶ have emphasized as essential to the emergence of Plains messianism had arisen in the southern plains long before 1890. It may well have been that a Ghost Dance could have swept northward from the Comanches in 1873 had not their initial effort ended in such utter disaster.

As is well known, Professor Kroeber has laid the indifference of the California tribes to the great movement of 1890 to "immunization" by their previous experience in the 1870's.¹⁷ This thesis aptly applies to the Comanches, who were coldly indifferent to the Ghost Dance which raged through the Plains at the end of the century. The sole Comanches to take up that dance were a few northerners who were in close contact with their dancing neighbors, and the Swift Stingers band—the one Comanche band which had refused to participate in the outbreak of 1873.¹⁸ Mooney's explanation, which laid the Comanche rejection of the Ghost Dance to a "general skeptical temperament of the Comanches" and to a "tribal pride against borrowing from others, as they considered their own mescal rite sufficient,"¹⁹ must now be discarded in its entirety.

E. ADAMSON HOEBEL

UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA

THE SOUTHERN UTE PEYOTE CULT

In his article on *The Character and History of the Southern Ute Peyote Rite*,¹ Dr Marvin K. Opler presents a description of the cult and an interpretation of the conditions relating to its acceptance which warrant further discussion. In January, 1938, I spent a week with peyotists on the Ute Mountain reservation at Towaoc, Colorado, in circumstances ideal for learning about peyotism.² Several coincidences contributed to my being favorably received: at Blanding, Utah, on my way to Colorado, I had been instrumental in having two Towaoc peyotists released from jail, where they

¹³ A. L. Kroeber, *Handbook of the Indians of California* (Bureau of American Ethnology, Bulletin 78, 1925).

¹⁴ R. H. Lowie, *Primitive Religion* (New York, 1924), pp. 193-195.

¹⁵ Wallis, *op. cit.*, pp. 148-149.

¹⁶ A. Lesser, *The Pawnee Ghost Dance Hand Game* (Columbia University Contributions to Anthropology, xvi, 1933), p. 59. ¹⁷ Kroeber, *op. cit.*, pp. 868-869.

¹⁸ James Mooney, *The Ghost Dance Religion and the Sioux Outbreak of 1890* (Bureau of American Ethnology, Report 14, 1896), pp. 901-902. ¹⁹ *Ibid.*

¹ (American Anthropologist, 42, 1940), pp. 463-478.

² Incidental to a Culture Element Distribution Survey under the auspices of the Department of Anthropology, University of California, Berkeley.

had been placed for selling peyote; the man recommended by the agent as a reliable interpreter was the Southern Ute who had attended the same peyote meeting I had at Randlett, Utah. Our conversation each day during the two-hour drive from the agency to my informant was about peyotism. We exchanged peyote songs and talked about his trips to peyote meetings in Utah and Oklahoma. Each noon I ate lunch with the family of my informant where a Christian-peyote blessing was said over the food; at their request I pronounced two blessings. Finally, I was able to attend one of the Towaoc peyote meetings.

There were two meetings that Saturday night, each sponsored by a wealthy Ute sheepman, one held in a house and the other in a hogan (I was told a large tipi was used in the summer). Except that it was held in a hogan instead of a house, the meeting I attended was almost identical to the one I had participated in at Randlett. The devotees referred to their form of the cult as the "Tipi Way," and identified themselves with the Native American (Peyote) Church of Oklahoma. Nearly all elements of the ceremony duplicated those I observed in Utah and which are described by La Barre as typical of the Kiowa-Comanche "Way," the most orthodox sect of the Plains.

Not only was the ritual carefully directed to correspond to the Plains prototype, but the ideology fit the Christian-like pattern observed by Kroeber among the Arapaho, and recognized by me among the Northern Ute. "Jesus" and "Jesus save me" occurred in several songs; prayers were addressed to "Jesus, God, Mary, and Peyote"; "brotherly love," "chastity," "charity," "love," and "faith" were English words in Ute prayers; and blessings were invoked for Commissioner Collier, Senator Thomas, the agent at Towaoc, leaders of the Native American Church in Oklahoma and Utah, and for me. All mankind were included in their prayers, but local members, especially the sick, were particularly blessed. Only two features of the Towaoc ceremony appeared unique: one member brought a sack of ground peyote which he ate and shared after midnight, and instead of allowing me to contribute to the expense of the meeting, I was given fifty cents in appreciation of my prayers and interest, which they hoped would continue.

The information concerning peyotism at Towaoc which I acquired differs somewhat from Opler's account, probably because Opler did not attend a peyote meeting.³ From Opler's description, the Southern Ute cult appears to have several new features which make it seem very different from the Plains cult described by La Barre. This impression is given in spite of Opler's statement that the two cults are in close correspondence. However, these particular features did not appear at the peyote meeting I attended at Towaoc or in any of my observations there; and in order to have the record straight for anyone who wishes to use the material for comparative purposes, I wish to state that the following features which Opler attributed to both the Ignacio and Towaoc peyote ceremonies were not observed by me: removal of shoes before entering the meeting; use of "a painted stick such as a shaman might carry, but with twelve feathers tied to it," (a plain stick or a collapsible cane

³ In conversation Opler told me he thought it unwise to attend a meeting.

beaded at the joints was used; the twelve-feathered fan was sometimes held with the cane); brushing against left side of door when entering; placing sick person "between the crescent-shaped mound and the doorway"; passing buttons one at a time; taking buttons from sack restricted to leader; appointing someone to feed peyote to sick person; designation of persons "with power" to smoke and pray while sick person is being fed; singing of only one song at beginning or end of meeting, (Opening and Closing songs were sung, these special songs being repeated four times or combined with three others); restriction against sick person holding cane or rattle, (if sick person could sit up, he could participate fully); rule that "the young girl sent to fetch the water is always a virgin," (the leader's wife was sent); leader drinking last at midnight; special guards protecting women when they relieve themselves at midnight, (families went out together); calling upon persons "with curing power to pray over the sick," (everyone prayed for the sick, especially the leader, who achieved that distinction by learning the ritual, often during a trip to Oklahoma); making special prayers "for seeing into the future, for finding something which has been lost," (prayers were as generalized and as specific as in any Protestant Church); tracing "moon on a white cloth" and throwing out the clay moon; having a special ritual meal for only the sick person; praying before being allowed to smoke, (everyone smoked at start of meeting, and during meeting a person "prayed through" the smoke of his cigarette); designating payments for cures, (donations were received to defray the expense of getting peyote). Moreover, Opler states emphatically that the Towaoc cult lacks Christian elements and signalizes the conflict between peyotists and missionaries. However, I have shown above that numerous Christian references and elements are found in the peyote ceremony. Furthermore, my informants told me their religion was "Indian Christianity" and that they had attempted to combine with the Protestant mission on the reservation. The missionary, of course, refused the offer and redoubled his attack on peyotism. The peyotists thereafter disliked the missionary, but they maintain their conviction that their religion is fundamentally Christian and look to the time when an understanding pastor will recognize that fact and unite with them.

There appears to be another possible explanation for the discrepancies between Opler's and my information concerning the Towaoc cult. He gives "a composite picture of peyote ritual as presented in the accounts of some twenty Towaoc and Ignacio informants" and assumes that the cult is the same in both places, except that the Ignacio version "adds Christian symbols at convenient points." Although I maintain that Christian ideology is also part of Towaoc peyotism, there still remains a possibility that the Ignacio cult is not identical to the one at Towaoc. I suspect that the form of peyotism which was introduced into Ignacio was not the "Tipi Way" sect, but a different sect known as the "Old Sioux Way." There is evidence that Ignacio peyotism is a separate cult. In the first place, the Ignacio cult was started by a Sioux Indian, Sam Loganberry, in 1917, whereas the present Towaoc cult did not get its start until 1931 and came directly from the Northern Ute. Is this the same Sioux, Sam Roan Bear, who introduced peyote to the Uintah Ute about 1914? I have fairly good evidence that the same man held meetings among the Ute,

Goshute, Bannock, Shoshone, Crow, and Taos Indians. The Uintah Ute and Goshute recognize distinctions between the "Old Sioux Way" and the more recent "Tipi Way," the two sects now present on their reservations. There is no description of the "Old Sioux Way," and the full extent of its aberrance is not known, but its adherents never smoke and are more quiet and "pious" in meetings, and at times they construct a small sand crescent upon a piece of cloth instead of the large moon constructed on the floor in the "Tipi Way." The name of the introducer, the date of establishment, and Opler's statement that the leader "appoints two men to trace the moon on a white cloth which they do by lifting the moon on the cloth" hint that the Ignacio Ute might belong to the "Old Sioux Way" sect of peyotism. If this is the case, the details which Opler attributes to both cults, but which are not present at Towaoc, may belong to the Ignacio sect.

Do these data confirm Opler's analysis of the reason for the acceptance of peyotism and for its integration into Towaoc Ute culture? The fact that the cult there is a typical example of the Native American Church with its share of Christian ideology, and the fact that the peyotists attempted to join forces with the missionaries render suspect his view that "at Towaoc, peyote easily fits into the category of customary curing rituals which exalt the power of shamanistic cures and successfully opposes 'Indian religion' to white doctrine." Furthermore, shamanism persists outside the cult. My interpreter's wife was treated by a non-peyotist shaman the day following the peyote meeting she had attended, and later was admitted to the hospital. This suggests that peyotism was added to Towaoc culture, but remained distinct from other curing methods. Not only are there a few shamans who have not joined the new religion, but according to my informants and the agent, about ten per cent of the Indians at Towaoc have resisted it.

Ten per cent is a small minority, yet it should not be ignored, and it makes inexact the term "universal" acceptance. Should we assume that the few who were not converted suffered less deprivation than those who joined the new religion? Opler implies that everyone at Towaoc belonged to the cult, but he does not give us the data on which he based his judgment. Of the dozen or so members I came to know well, two men each owned over a thousand head of sheep, accordingly would not be poor by any standards of western United States. It is a curious coincidence that about the same proportion of the population at Ignacio joined the peyote cult as refused to affiliate at Towaoc, and until their relation to the whole group and their position within the culture is understood, the correctness of any general explanation of the rôle of peyotism among the Southern Ute may be questioned.

Opler appears to me to reverse himself when he explains that, "at Towaoc, peyote easily fits into the category of customary curing rituals" and "serves to strengthen beliefs in the efficacy of native curing"; then says, "peyote encounters the active resistance of shamans who view the breakdown of old patterns at Ignacio with alarm." It is true that he shows the Ignacio group better acculturated in an agricultural economy than the Towaoc, but curing ceremonies are parts of aboriginal culture common to both and it seems logical that the force preserving them among one group of Southern Ute should do the same with the other.

Another point that will bear further attention is Opler's conclusion based on the similarities between the aboriginal ceremonials and the peyote ceremony. He interprets peyotism at Towaoc "as a type of revivalistic movement . . . which crystallizes a number of ancient Ute conceptions and welds them together into a societal organization." My informants said the peyote cult was introduced from the outside (Opler says from the Northern Ute), and they make repeated pilgrimages to Utah and Oklahoma to receive instruction and inspiration for keeping the ritual and theology correct and to obtain peyote. They never talked of peyotism as a rebirth and reworking of ancient ceremonies. Inasmuch as all observable features of Southern Ute peyotism were present in the cult among those from whom the Southern Ute received it, there is some hazard in assuming that certain practices or attitudes were "easily transferred" from a native ceremony. Nor is it safe to stress only similarities that might exist between the introduced and the indigenous ceremonies and to assume that those similarities facilitated the acceptance of the new ritual. Mere coincidence does not justify one in assuming a relationship where complex factors are involved. To be objective, differences between Southern Ute rituals and the peyote ritual should be given equal attention, and then there would be the task of proving whether resemblances aid more than disparities hinder acceptance. In such a bewildering complex of factors, selection of the most important is extremely difficult.

Opler does not comment on the fact that the Towaoc Ute did not accept the peyote cult in 1916. Yet his major thesis is that events set in motion in 1895 prepared the way of peyote's immediate and whole-hearted approval in 1931. He pictures peyotism, spurned in 1916, being embraced in 1931, and in the space of five years becoming "a bulwark of faith in things Indian," "infusing a new life into the old culture," serving "to strengthen beliefs in the efficacy of native curing," "strengthening social solidarity," and "forming a solid defense of native sentiments." During the years between 1916 and 1931, the Towaoc Utes visited their friends and relatives at Ignacio and on the Uintah-Ouray reservation. Why did they not adopt this marvelous institution in 1930, or 1929, or 1925? If the key to the situation lies, as Opler says, in "economic impoverishment" of the Towaoc Utes and their desire to "escape from an intolerable social environment," then they should have grasped the opportunity when it was first offered, or they should have seized it sometime during the fifteen years of their acquaintance with it. There should at least be an explanation why they did not.

In spite of the importance of the general culture history of the Southern Ute which Opler has presented, there are other factors which have been overlooked and which might answer the questions I have raised. I can think of a few things which could have directed the rôle of peyotism at Towaoc and Ignacio. Opler suggests one in his study of Southern Ute acculturation,⁴ namely, the power of the chief. In spite of intolerable conditions and desire to escape into the past, a strong chief opposed to

⁴ In *Acculturation in Seven American Indian Tribes*, edited by Ralph Linton, New York, 1940.

the cult might have kept it from the reservation in 1916 and for a number of years thereafter. The present chief at Towaoc is a peyotist, and it is conceivable that the rise of the cult on his reservation began when he, or another friendly leader, replaced one who had opposed peyote. The early fortunes of peyotism among the Comanche reflect almost exactly old Quanah Parker's attitude toward the cult. Or, perhaps it was the personality of the peyote proselytor who brought the cult. Sam Loganberry might not have appealed to the Towaoc Ute, whereas John Peehart did. It is easier to believe that the cultural situation was favorable for the introduction of the cult and that some minor variable blocked it than to believe that the whole culture suddenly became attuned in 1931 after being out of tune for fifteen years.

OMER C. STEWART

MINNEAPOLIS, MINNESOTA

EARLY SPANISH ACCOUNTS OF THE APACHE INDIANS

When the Turk guided Coronado and his soldiers into the land of the buffalo in 1541, in search of the mythical kingdom of the Gran Quivira, the Spaniards saw Indians unlike any they had previously encountered. These were nomadic buffalo hunters, called Querechos, who were later known as Apaches, a name believed to have come from the Zuñi word *apachu* (enemy), their name for the Navajos.¹ The Querechos were large, well-built Indians, and very intelligent. They roamed the plains after the vast herds of buffalo, and passed the winters camped near the pueblos. Great numbers of shaggy, well-trained dogs transported their belongings from place to place. Evidently the Querechos employed little if any agriculture, but instead relied upon trade with the Pueblo tribes to supply them with corn, cotton blankets, and pottery, for which they exchanged salt, buffalo hides, and dried meat. The Querechos were great traders, whole rancherías of them going on trading expeditions. They also had a well developed sign language, which the Spaniards easily understood.

Castañeda, a member of Coronado's expedition, told of coming to some settlements of people who lived like Arabs and who were called Querechos in that region. "These folks live in tents made of the tanned skins of the cows [buffalo]. They travel around near the cows, killing them for food. They did nothing unusual when they saw our army, except to come out of their tents and look at us, after which they came to talk to the advance guard, and asked who we were. The general talked with them. . . . That they were very intelligent is evident from the fact that although they conversed by means of signs they made themselves understood so well that there was no need of an interpreter. . . . These folks started off from here next day with a lot of dogs which dragged their possessions."²

Castañeda later gave a more detailed account of the buffalo hunting tribes—Querechos and Teyas (Asenay?). "As I have related in the first part, people follow the cows, hunting them and tanning the skins to take to the settlements in the win-

¹ F. W. Hodge, *Handbook of American Indians*, Wash., D. C., 1907, i, 63.

² G. P. Winship, *Journey of Coronado*, N. Y., 1904, pp. 65-66.